

Committee(s):	Date(s):	
Streets and Walkways Sub- Committee Projects Sub-Committee	19 th November 2012 21 st November 2012	

Subject: 8-10 Moorgate Area Improvements	Public
Report of: Director of the Built Environment	For Decision

Summary

Dashboard

Project Status	Green
Timeline	Evaluation (Outline Options Appraisal – Gateway 3)
Total Estimated Cost	£306,151.75 (Section 106)
Spend to Date	£14,395 of £28,586 (Evaluation Budget) – comprising of: £6,000 (staff costs) for Options Appraisal and Report and £8,395 (consultant fees) to undertake surveys and prepare design material.
Overall project risk	Green

Context

This report explores options to improve the environment of streets and spaces in the vicinity of the 8-10 Moorgate redevelopment which is a 9 storey predominantly office building with a retail unit on Telegraph Street and residential accommodation (9 units) accessed from Tokenhouse Yard.

This project is funded from a Section 106 contribution of £306,151.75 from the 8-10 Moorgate development, which is specifically allocated for community facilities, environmental improvements and transportation works in the area of land surrounding the development, as shown in the Section 106 (S106) site location plan area (Appendix A). This agreement was originally agreed in 2007 (re-issued in 2012 due to a revised planning application) and is a relatively small area close to the development. Under the terms of the agreement the type of works to be carried out is limited to works to improve the pedestrian environment of the alleys, courts and lanes within this area. This is related to ensuring that the impact of the development on its locality is mitigated by measures funded by the S.106 payments. This area has been evaluated to assess the priorities for improvements. Photographs of the area are in Appendix C

The development is within the Bank conservation area which is typified by a series of narrow courts and lanes of medieval origin, and substantial Portland stone buildings of unifying neoclassical designs.

Brief description of project

There are a variety of highway types in the Section 106 area, including the southern half of Moorgate, Lothbury and Copthall Avenue and lanes such as Telegraph Street, Tokenhouse Yard and Great Swan Alley. The lanes and alleys adjacent to the development have been the focus of this evaluation, given the size of the S.106 contribution and the minimal impact this would have on improving major streets, and the presumption that enhancements would be close to the development. Details of this assessment are summarised in the Options Appraisal Matrix (paragraphs 21 - 25).

The recommended enhancements to Telegraph Street help to join up and enhance an

important and successful east west walking route from the Guildhall to Aldgate. This operates as an alternative walking route through the eastern half of the City that avoids Bank, and has the capacity to take more people and be more joined up and accessible. The recommended enhancements to Tokenhouse Yard create a pocket public space in an area of the City with proportionately the least provision of open space for its local community.

Options

Description	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4	Option 5
	Improvements to Telegraph Street & Tokenhouse Yard	Improvements to Moorgate	Improvements to Lanes and Alleys off Moorgate	Improvements to Great Swan Alley and Cophall Avenue.	Improvements to Lothbury

Five outline options have been identified but cannot be fully costed at this stage. Detailed costs of the approved option will be determined at the next stage of reporting (detailed design).

Recommendations

Option(s) recommended to develop to next Gateway

It is recommended to Members to take forward Option 1 – Improvements to Telegraph Street and Tokenhouse Yard, directly adjacent to the 8-10 Moorgate development.

Next Steps

If approved, the next Gateway report would be a Gateway 4 (detailed options appraisal) report to Committees.

Resource requirements to reach next Gateway and source of funding

£14,191 is required to advance Option 1 to detailed options appraisal stage. This will be contained within the existing £28,586 evaluation budget which has been already allocated from the 8-10 Moorgate S106 agreement.

Financial assessment/Investment Appraisal to be provided at the next Gateway

The total funding available from the 8-10 Moorgate S106 agreement for Local Community Facilities, Environmental Improvements and Transportation Works is £306,151.75 (excluding interest). Of the £306,151.75 received, £28,586 has already been allocated for evaluation, leaving £277,565.75 to deliver the physical enhancements to the area. All of the options contained within this report, including the recommended option 1, will be designed within the £277,565.75 remaining. Full cost estimates will be developed at the detailed options appraisal stage (gateway 4).

Plans for consultation prior to the next Gateway report

It is proposed to carry out further consultation with local occupiers within the area following the recommendation of Committee Members. Ward members will also be consulted as will appropriate internal departments.

Tolerances

It is proposed to utilise the full budget available on the improvements. Costs will be further

refined at the next stage of reporting and the final scheme adjusted accordingly to remain within budget.

Main Report

Overview

1. Evidence of Need	<p>The Section 106 plan area (Appendix A) includes an area around the development where the funds can be spent. This area has been evaluated to assess the priorities for improvements.</p> <p>This area is typified by narrow courts and lanes of medieval origin and is heavily used by pedestrians, particularly in peak hours. The East-West routes operate as important routes for pedestrians avoiding the busy areas in and around Bank Junction. The new Crossrail Station at Moorgate and various redevelopments in the area, including 8-10 Moorgate will result in an increase in pedestrian numbers which will put further pressure on the streets and lanes. There is a need and benefit to improving the walking routes in the area, create more space for pedestrians, including space to rest and improve access for all. According to demographic and economic projections contained within the City's Core Strategy, it is estimated that both population and employment figures will increase by approximately 15% and 25% respectively in the period from 2011 to 2026.</p> <p>It is therefore reasonable to expect that primary pedestrian routes will increasingly have to accommodate the needs of an increasing number of workers, visitors and a new residential population.</p> <p>Telegraph Street, on the north side of the development, is part of a busy and successful east-west pedestrian route that runs from the Guildhall through the Eastern City Cluster to Aldgate (see Appendix B). Telegraph Street links Masons Avenue and Great Bell Alley to Copthall Buildings and Austin Friars. Although it is not a through-route for vehicles, it is used for servicing of the pub. This is in conflict with it being constantly used by pedestrians, who normally walk in the carriageway due to the narrowness of the footways. A potential commercial tenant has made City officers aware of the importance of accessible footways because some of their staff are wheelchair users. This is an important consideration as footways on both sides of the street are very narrow and are not accessible for wheelchair users. Improvements to this street will be particularly beneficial</p>
----------------------------	--

when the development at 8-10 Moorgate is complete.

The northern arm of Tokenhouse Yard to the east of the development is a quiet street that is currently used as a designated parking area for motorcycles. This street has potential for the creation of a 'pocket' open space with an enhanced street environment to provide seating and trees, (one of the few opportunities in this area for tree planting). This is an area of the City with proportionately the least provision of open space for its local community. The City has adopted an open spaces strategy that will seek to maintain the current proportion of open space to meet the needs of a growing daytime population. This can only be achieved through the creation of small open spaces in this manner.

Moorgate is a main street which runs north-south through the area. The footways are paved in York stone and are heavily used by pedestrians. This street is a key bus route and has a very functional feel, with no street trees to soften the environment and absorb pollution or spaces for pedestrians to rest. The pedestrian environment would benefit from improvements and there is also scope for access improvements, particularly at crossing points and side streets.

Copthall Avenue and Great Swan Alley are utilised by vehicles to service surrounding offices and retail units. They also form part of a popular 'rat run' by vehicles in the area that wish to travel south from London Wall. Copthall Avenue also has numerous retail units at the northern end. There is a need to improve the pedestrian experience in these streets in order to ensure a safe and accessible street environment. This could include improved lighting, raised entry treatments at junctions and widened footways.

Further south is Lothbury, which has footways paved in York stone and includes several Listed Buildings, namely the Bank of England. There is scope for some improvements to this street and these would need to be carefully designed with reference to the important listed buildings. However, there is limited scope for functional improvements to the street environment as some enhancements have already been delivered as part of the 1 Lothbury project originally approved by Streets and Walkways in February 2009.

The evaluation has shown that pedestrians are likely to derive the greatest benefit from improvements to Telegraph Street and Tokenhouse Yard. Telegraph Street, in particular has been identified as a main east west pedestrian route and also runs adjacent to the redevelopment site along with

	Tokenhouse Yard.
2. Success Criteria	To provide an enhanced street environment that improves accessibility and road safety and creates more space for pedestrians, including space to rest.
3. Project Scope and Exclusions	A plan of the project area is included in Appendix A
4. Link to Strategic Aims	<p>This project has links to the following strategic aim:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To provide modern, efficient and high quality local services and policing within the Square Mile for workers, residents and visitors with a view to delivering sustainable outcomes <p>This project will provide a safer, more accessible and more attractive street environment for the benefit of all who use the area.</p>
5. Within which category does the project fit	4. Fully Reimbursable
6. What is the priority of the project?	B. Advisable
7. Governance arrangements	There will be regular meetings with the Senior Responsible Officer. No Project Board is required given the scale of the scheme.
8. Resources Expended To Date	£6,000 (staff costs) for the Outline Options Appraisal and the preparation of necessary reports. £8,395 (consultant fees) to undertake surveys and prepare design material. This has been funded from the Section 106 obligation for 8-10 Moorgate.
9. Results of stakeholder consultation to date	<p>Some consultation has taken place with management of The Telegraph Public House which lies adjacent to the redevelopment site. The servicing arrangements for the pub will be a key issue to be explored at the next stage.</p> <p>A consultation plan is being developed to engage with stakeholders in Copthall Avenue and Great Swan Alley to ensure the least disruption to current servicing arrangements as part of the project. Further consultation is planned at the next stage with other local stakeholders and Ward Members as well as relevant internal stakeholders.</p>
10. Consequences if	If not approved, the opportunity to enhance the pedestrian

<p>project not approved</p>	<p>environment would be missed. The streets would still need to accommodate increased numbers of pedestrians as a result of the developments nearby and the Crossrail station. Existing deficiencies would therefore be exacerbated and walking routes would not be improved. The Section 106 funds would need to be returned to the developer or their use renegotiated as they have been allocated for a specific purpose of local environmental enhancement.</p>
------------------------------------	---

Outline Options Appraisal

<p>11. Commentary on the options considered</p>	<p>Option 1 (Recommended to be taken through to Gateway 4 - Detailed Options Appraisal): Improvements to Telegraph Street and Tokenhouse Yard.</p> <p>Telegraph Street is part of a main walking route from east to west which operates as an alternative pedestrian route through the eastern half of the City that avoids the Bank transport hub (please also see plan in Appendix B). It is also immediately to the north of the 8-10 Moorgate development, which will result in more people from the development using the route in the future.</p> <p>The improvement of Telegraph Street would help to mitigate the impact of the development on the area. Design elements would consider the possibility of raising the carriageway to footway level to improve pedestrian access and provide more space for walking. Improvements to road safety would also be considered as part of the detailed site appraisal which may include pedestrianising the street.</p> <p>This option would provide further improvements to local amenity by introducing a quiet public space in Tokenhouse Yard with possible tree planting and seating. Tokenhouse Yard is the main access to the residential units that are part of the redevelopment of 8-10 Moorgate. This is currently an area of the City with proportionately the least provision of open space for its local community and would provide opportunities for resting and improve green coverage.</p> <p>Evaluation of appropriate surface materials and local servicing requirements will form part of the Detailed Options Appraisal Gateway 4 report.</p> <p>Option 2 (Not recommended to be taken through to Gateway 4 - Detailed Options Appraisal): Improvements to Moorgate.</p> <p>Enhancements to Moorgate would improve the pedestrian experience on what is a heavily trafficked street. Improvements would include raised entry treatments on the</p>
--	---

numerous side streets to improve access and movement, widened footways, possible tree planting and improved crossing points. The scale of this street would limit the scope of the improvements as funds are limited and therefore this option is not recommended to be taken forward to the next stage.

Option 3 (Not recommended to be taken through to Gateway 4 - Detailed Options Appraisal): Improvements to various Alleys and Lanes off Moorgate such as Great Bell Alley, Kings Arms Yard and Nun Court.

This option would include improvements to many of the more discreet locations off of the main Moorgate route. Several of these alleys are quite stark and uninviting and many are underutilised. It is proposed to improve the appearance of these routes to make them more attractive walking routes. This would include improvements to lighting, paving and wayfinding as well as access improvements. This option is not recommended to be taken forward as Telegraph Street and Token House Yard have greater need of enhancement.

Option 4 (Not recommended to be taken through to Gateway 4 - Detailed Options Appraisal): Improvements to Great Swan Alley and Cophall Avenue.

This option seeks improvements to Great Swan Alley which runs east and west of Moorgate and Cophall Avenue which runs north to south. There is potential to improve the pedestrian experience in the area and to enhance road safety by improving lighting, adding raised entry treatments at junctions and widening footways. This option is not recommended to be taken forward as Telegraph Street and Token House Yard are in greater need of enhancement.

Option 5 (Not recommended to be taken through to Gateway 4 - Detailed Options Appraisal): Improvements to Lothbury.

This option seeks to improve Lothbury which is runs along the north wall of the Bank of England and is flanked by other heritage buildings in the area. This street is a popular pedestrian route to and from the east. In recent years a residential refurbishment has been completed on Lothbury, opposite the Bank of England which has coincided with the completion of new office accommodation in Throgmorton Street. It is possible to improve the pedestrian experience in this area by widening the footways, improving paving materials (given the proximity of Listed Buildings and setting within a Conservation Area) and carrying out access

	improvements. However, it is considered that more significant benefits can be delivered at Telegraph Street and Token House Yard with the budget available as some enhancements have already been delivered at Lothbury as part of a project originally approved by Streets and Walkways in February 2009.
--	--

Information Common to All Options

12. Key benefits	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improve access for pedestrians and provide safer routes in line with the Local Implementation Plan's transport objectives • Provide more much-needed space for pedestrians in this increasingly busy area • Enhance the environment and make a positive contribution to the character and appearance of the Bank Conservation Area 												
13. Estimated programme and key dates	It is proposed to submit a Gateway 4 report to Committees in early 2013. The implementation of the works would be immediately after the completion of the development which is expected to be completed by the end of 2013.												
14. Potential risk implications	<p>Potential main risks are captured in the table below:</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Key risk</th> <th>Risk value</th> <th>Risk response</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Objections from local occupiers</td> <td>medium</td> <td>Consult with local occupiers as design is developed to assess their needs.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Tree planting not feasible</td> <td>medium</td> <td>Accept. Modify and adapt design proposal if needed.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Project costs exceed budget</td> <td>medium</td> <td>Ensure design is developed that fits available budget.</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Key risk	Risk value	Risk response	Objections from local occupiers	medium	Consult with local occupiers as design is developed to assess their needs.	Tree planting not feasible	medium	Accept. Modify and adapt design proposal if needed.	Project costs exceed budget	medium	Ensure design is developed that fits available budget.
Key risk	Risk value	Risk response											
Objections from local occupiers	medium	Consult with local occupiers as design is developed to assess their needs.											
Tree planting not feasible	medium	Accept. Modify and adapt design proposal if needed.											
Project costs exceed budget	medium	Ensure design is developed that fits available budget.											
15. Anticipated stakeholders and consultees	Consultations would be required with local Ward Members, the developer of 8-10 Moorgate, The Telegraph Public House, local occupiers, the City's Access Service, the City Surveyor, the City Police, the Highways Division, the Cleansing Division, The Department of Open Spaces and other local stakeholders.												
16. Legal implications	In exercising its highway and traffic functions the City must have regard, amongst other things, to its duty to assert and protect the rights of the public to use and enjoyment of the												

	public highway (S.130 Highways Act 1980); its duty to secure the expeditious, safe and convenient movement of traffic (having regard to effect on amenities) (S.122 Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984); its duty to secure the efficient use of the road network avoiding congestion and disruption (S.16 Traffic Management Act 2004), and the co-ordination of street works (S.91 New Roads and Street Works Act 1991).
17. HR implications	N/A
18. Anticipated source(s) of funding – capital and revenue	The Section 106 Agreement related to the redevelopment of 8-10 Moorgate.
19. Affordability	The Section 106 Agreement related to the redevelopment of 8-10 Moorgate has a specific contribution for enhancements in this area.
20. Next steps	Following the decision of Committee to proceed with the recommended option(s), design development and further consultation will take place. A detailed options appraisal (Gateway 4) report will be prepared for early 2013.

Outline Options Appraisal Matrix

See paragraphs 21-25 below.

Appendices

Appendix A	Plan of project area
Appendix B	Plan of Guildhall to Aldgate Walking Route
Appendix C	Photographs of project area

Contact

Report Author	Emmanuel Ojugo
Email Address	emmanuel.ojugo@cityoflondon.gov.uk
Telephone Number	020 7332 1158

Outline Options Appraisal Matrix


<u>Recommendation</u>	<i>Option 1</i>	<i>Option 2</i>	<i>Option 3</i>	<i>Option 4</i>	<i>Option 5</i>
	Improve Telegraph Street and Tokenhouse Yard. (Recommended)	Improvements to Moorgate (Not recommended)	Improvements to various alleys and lanes off Moorgate (Not recommended)	Improvements to Great Swan Alley and Cophall Avenue. (Not recommended)	Improvements to Lothbury. (Not Recommended)

	<i>Option 1</i>	<i>Option 2</i>	<i>Option 3</i>	<i>Option 4</i>	<i>Option 5</i>
21. Brief description	Improve Telegraph Street and Tokenhouse Yard.	Improvements to Moorgate	Improvements to various alleys and lanes off Moorgate	Improvements to Great Swan Alley and Cophall Avenue.	Improvements to Lothbury.
22. Legal implications (where different to section 16)	As Section 16	May require agreement with Transport for London	As Section 16	As Section 16	As Section 16

23. <u>Financial Implications</u>	The total funding available from the 8-10 Moorgate S106 agreement for Local Community Facilities, Environmental Improvements and Transportation Works is £306,151.75 (excluding interest). Of the £306,151.75 received, £28,586 has already been allocated for evaluation, leaving £277,565.75 to deliver the physical enhancements to the area. All of the options contained within this report, including the recommended option 1, will be designed within the £277,565.75 remaining. Full cost estimates will be developed at the detailed options appraisal stage (gateway 4).
--	---

Outline Options Appraisal Matrix

<u>Recommendation</u>	<i>Option 1</i> Improve Telegraph Street and Tokenhouse Yard. (Recommended)	<i>Option 2</i> Improvements to Moorgate (Not recommended)	<i>Option 3</i> Improvements to various alleys and lanes off Moorgate (Not recommended)	<i>Option 4</i> Improvements to Great Swan Alley and Copthall Avenue. (Not recommended)	<i>Option 5</i> Improvements to Lothbury. (Not Recommended)
-----------------------	--	---	---	--	--

24. Reasons	Telegraph Street and Tokenhouse Yard have been assessed by officers as having the greatest potential for enhancements in this area.	Given the limited funds available, there is little scope for comprehensive improvements to this street as part of this project.	The lanes and alleys have scope for improvement. However, of the more popular routes, Telegraph Street have the biggest accessibility constraints.	These streets are key routes for servicing vehicles and improvements would only deliver limited benefits to pedestrians in terms of improved crossing points, access and road safety improvements.	Lothbury is currently paved in York stone with building mounted street lighting. There is limited scope for improvement or increasing walking space, due to the need to keep access to the loading bay for the Bank of England.
Reasons Continued 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Would provide an enhanced environment • Would improve access for wheelchair users • Would Improve the safety of pedestrians by reducing potential for conflict on Telegraph Street which is currently a narrow service street • Would create opportunities for rest by 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Possible conflict with main carriageway function • Funds would limit improvements to crossing points for pedestrians • Tree planting would only be possible with footway widening 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Many are cul-de sacs or have been improved/planned for improvement as part of other schemes • Several of these lanes and alleys are already pedestrianised and have good accessibility 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • tree planting is unlikely due to the width of the carriageway and service entries • Scope for footway widening is limited due to the functional nature of the streets 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improvements have been carried out as part of a previous scheme to Lothbury approved by Members in 2009

Outline Options Appraisal Matrix

<u>Recommendation</u>	<i>Option 1</i> Improve Telegraph Street and Tokenhouse Yard. (Recommended)	<i>Option 2</i> Improvements to Moorgate (Not recommended)	<i>Option 3</i> Improvements to various alleys and lanes off Moorgate (Not recommended)	<i>Option 4</i> Improvements to Great Swan Alley and Copthall Avenue. (Not recommended)	<i>Option 5</i> Improvements to Lothbury. (Not Recommended)
	providing seating <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Would Introduce trees and improves local biodiversity • The enhancement works would coincide with the completion of the 8-10 Moorgate development in order to maximise the benefits and mitigate the impact of the development on the local streets. 				